# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

3V, INC., a Delaware Corporation,	)
Plaintiff	)
	) C.A. No. 06-00593-JJF
V.	)
CIBA SPECIALTY CHEMICALS CORPORATION, a Delaware Corporation,	) ) )
Defendant.	) )
	)

## **REPLY TO COUNTERCLAIM**

COMES NOW the Plaintiff, 3V, Inc. ("3V"), by counsel, and for its Reply to the Counterclaim filed by CIBA Specialty Chemicals Corporation ("CIBA"), hereby answers each numbered paragraph of the Counterclaim with respectively numbered paragraphs as follows:

#### FIRST DEFENSE

The Counterclaim filed by CIBA is barred and precluded by limitations and/or lack of jurisdiction by failure to timely file the claims noted in the Counterclaim.

# **SECOND DEFENSE**

- 19. Denied.
- 20. That it admits the averments in the first sentence, but denies the remaining averments of paragraph 20 of the Counterclaim.
- 21. That excluding item C, it denies all remaining averments in the Prayer for relief and denies all averments not heretofore specifically admitted.

WHEREFORE, the Plaintiff and Counterclaim Defendant 3V, Inc. respectfully requests that the Court enter a judgment dismissing the Counterclaim with prejudice and awarding 3V, Inc. its costs and attorneys' fees incurred in connection with this litigation, and any other relief which the Court deems appropriate.

Dated: October 31, 2006 STEVENS & LEE, P.C.

By: <u>/s/ Joseph Grey</u> Joseph Grey (ID 2358) 1105 North Market Street, Seventh Floor Wilmington, DE 19801 Telephone: (302) 654-5180

Telecopier: (302) 654-5181 E-Mail: jg@stevenslee.com

Raymond C. Stewart Quentin R. Corrie Birch, Stewart, Kolasch & Birch, LLP 8110 Gatehouse Road Suite 100 East Falls Church, VA 22040-0747 (703) 205-8000

Counsel for the Plaintiff 3V, Inc.

Case 1:06-cv-00593-JJF Document 6 Filed 10/31/2006 Page 3 of 3

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Joseph Grey, hereby certify that, on this 31<sup>st</sup> day of October, 2006, and in addition to the service provided by the Court's MC/ECF system, I caused true and correct copies of the foregoing Reply to Counterclaim to be served on the Defendant by first class, United States mail, postage prepaid and addressed as follows:

Frederick L. Cottrell III Esquire Chad M. Shandler, Esquire Richards Layton & Finger One Rodney Square, 10th Floor P.O. Box 551 Wilmington, DE 19899

Alan E.J. Branigan, Esquire Brion Heaney, Esquire Michael Culver, Esquire Millen White Zelano & Branigan, P.C. 2200 Clarendon Boulevard Suite 1400 Arlington, VA 22201

/s/ Joseph Grey
Joseph Grey